



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

ILLUMINATED HAGGADAHS*

By RACHEL VISHNITZER, Berlin.

A SPANISH miniature of the first half of the 15th century¹ represents the Grand Master of the Order of Calatrava, Don Luis de Guzman, sitting upon a golden throne, holding in his right hand his sword, and above his head an angel waving a banner with a red cross on it. By his side at the steps of the throne are a Dominican and Franciscan monk. Vassals and knights wearing the red cross of the Order are standing in long files. Lower down, before the basement of the marvellous architectural composition in which we admire the round Moorish dome, the slender horse-shoe arches and the Gothic pinnacles, there is a brilliant gathering of knights. The eye of the spectator is delighted with the rich variety of colors in the fur-trimmed tunics, shoes, girdles, swords, and the triumphant red of the innumerable crosses.

But there is someone amidst this distinguished company, a man in a long, greyish mantle, falling down in heavy deep folds, a man wearing a big badge on his right shoulder.

This man is Moses Arragel, the Rabbi of Guadalajara, a Castilian Jew. The Grand Master of the Order of Calatrava asked the learned Rabbi, who by the way was a vassal of the Order, to furnish a commented and illustrated Bible, "una biblia en romance, glosada e ystoriada"².

* The article is based chiefly on a comparative study of the Haggadahs Or. 2737 Or. 2884, Or. 1404, Add. 14761, and Add. 27210 in the British Museum, MS. 126 of the Frederick David Mocatta Library in London (Catalogue, 1904, p. 424), and the Spanish Haggadahs described in H. Mueller, J. Schlosser and D. Kaufmann, *Die Haggadah von Sarajevo*, Wien 1898.

¹ Casa de Alba, Madrid, reproduced in Duke of Bervick and Alba, *Noticia historicas y genealogicas de los estados de Montijo y Teba, segun los documentos de sus archivos*, Madrid 1915, pl. A opp. p. 18.

² S. Berger, *Les Bibles Castillanes*, Romania, 1899, 28e année, p. 522.

Moses Arragel undertook the task of revising the Castilian Bible translation according to the Hebrew tradition and completed his work about 1430. The miniature on the title page of the Bible shows the ceremony of the presentation.

Rabbi Arragel looks very dignified in the picture, and an innocent observer would surely take the brown badge on his shoulder for a decoration. But unfortunately the Jewish badge was not an honorable distinction. Quite the contrary.

The Jews made innumerable efforts to be freed of the badge, whole communities pleaded before the authorities for the abolition of the badge or at least for a reduction of its size.³ The Jews of Catalonia, for instance, had secured the privilege to hide the degrading mark, when wearing the long hooded cloak. It seems, however, that Moses Arragel, a Castilian, did not enjoy even this modest privilege. The miniature in the Olivares Bible, as the Castilian Bible is called, is an eloquent illustration to the paradoxes of Jewish realities. There we have a Jew enjoying the highest marks of esteem and the centre of a solemn performance at which the highest dignitaries of the Catholic Church took part, while other Jews represented on the same frontispiece are being succored, fed and clad by the misericordious friars. On the right side below there is a Jew discussing with a knight, who is piously listening to the eagerly gesticulating speaker. There is, as may be noticed, give and take, and exchange of services, an atmosphere of genuine humanity. The defamatory mark on the shoulder of the Rabbi, the large badge on his long robe, strikes us as an entirely unexpected feature

³ F. Baer, *Studien zur Geschichte der Juden im Koenigreich Aragonien waehrend des 13. and 14. Jahrhunderts*, Berlin, 1913, p. 186.

in that bright picture. But then we have to recollect that only some 60 years after Rabbi Arragel completed his marvellous work the Jews were altogether expelled from Spain, and that when in 1422 Friar Arias de Encinas, the guardian of the Franciscan Monastery at Toledo, addressed him as "Raby Mose amigo" only 31 years had elapsed since the great catastrophe—the massacres of the Jews all over Spain in 1391, during which many perished, others became homeless and deprived of means of existence.

The situation of the Jews indeed was a peculiar one. They were honored and they were despised, they were exalted and they were abased. In this atmosphere they had to live, to work, in this atmosphere they carried on scientific and artistic activities. History shows even two periods of upward development in Jewish intellectual culture in Spain. For the student of the artistic production of the Jews it is particularly noticeable that the Spanish Jews played a considerable part in literary work closely connected with the graphic arts. They wrote and translated treatises on astronomy, medicine, geology, geography, and the occult sciences, all of which required explanatory illustrations.

Writers like Ibn Sid, the Hazan of Toledo, who edited the famous astronomical tables, Judah ben Mosca, Abraham and Samuel Levi, who translated Arabic astrological writings, Judah Cresques, who compiled the Catalan Map, all of them were connected with calligraphists and illuminators, who copied their writings, decorated and illustrated them, even as Moses Arragel was necessarily connected with the artists of Toledo who illuminated his work. However, as Arragel's Bible was to be devoted to

⁴ S. Berger, *Les Bibles Castillanes*, p. 522.

the use of Catholics, he seems to have had scruples and hesitated to supervise the illustration.⁵ He pointed to the interdiction of images according to the Decalogue. But the Friar Arias de Encinas who was to collaborate with the Rabbi obviated the difficulty by offering to lend to the illuminators a beautifully illuminated manuscript belonging to the Cathedral of Toledo as a model.

The Catalan Map⁶, compiled in 1375 by Judah Cresques, a Jew of the Isle of Majorca, was an artistic work of lavish splendor and cultivated taste, painted in bright, resonant colors, embellished with gold and silver, ornamented with elaborate pen-work in various inks, with allegorical figures, symbolical signs, armorial bearings, and architectural accessories. The writing was executed in beautiful characters, with illuminated initials. The astronomical tables, the Signs of the Zodiac, the four seasons, appealed strongly to the imagination of the illuminator who treated the geographical map as wonderful fairy-tales.

Another scientific work, the treatise on precious stones, the "Lapidario" of 1279,⁷ was adorned with hunting scenes, with chimeric beasts, with ships and castles, with masks, musical instruments, arabesques, acanthus, and other scroll ornaments. It is a very significant fact that in the 13th and 14th century the graphic arts were no longer confined exclusively to religion; as may be ascertained from even the few quoted examples, they had been secularized.

⁵ S. Berger, *op. cit.*, p. 523.

⁶ No. 119, *Catalogue des MSS. espagnols de la Bibliothèque Nationale*, reproduced in A. E. Nordenskjold, *Periplus*, Engl. Edition, Stockholm, 1897, pl. XI-XIV; *Notices et extraits des MSS. de la Bibliothèque du roi et autres bibliothèques*, publiés par l'Institut Royal de France, T. XIV, Paris, 1843, 2. partie, Buchon et Tastu, p. L-152, fac-similes lithographiques (with the Catalan text of the map and a French translation of the same). Very good reproductions in *Choix des Documents Géographiques conservés à la Bibliothèque Nationale*, Paris, 1883, pl. IX-XX, heliographic plates.

⁷ *Lapidario del Rey D. Alfonso X*, Codice original. Published by Don A. Selfa and Don H. Rodriguez y Sagasta, with preface by Con J. Fernandez Montana, Madrid, 1881.

Book illumination began now to spread through the medium of literary works of general use. In consequence of it the Jews accepted more willingly features of Christian illumination. They borrowed them more light-heartedly from secular books. That we are aware of the religious origin of this book illustration does not prove at all that they noticed it as well. They very likely did not.

Jewish illuminated books are to be found in all the great collections of Europe. The British Museum, the Mocatta Library, the Jews' College in London, the Bibliothèque Nationale in Paris, the Asiatic Museum in Petrograd, the Berson Museum in Warsaw, the Bodleian, Cambridge, Manchester, Nuremberg, Frankfurt (on the Main), Darmstadt, Munich libraries etc., private collections like that of Mr. Elkan N. Adler, Dr. Gaster, D. Guenzburg, M. Kirschstein, D. Sassoon, and many others possess precious specimens of Jewish illumination and penmanship. Among these illuminated MSS. are to be found Bible codices, prayer books (mahzorim and siddurim), theological, philosophical, and medical treatises, law books, ketubot or marriage certificates, Purim rolls, Haggadahs, and various other documents.

As an illustrated book the Book of the Passover Service occupies a prominent place among them. The Haggadah was not intended for the Synagogue Service; written for laymen, for the use of the family and especially for children, the Haggadah was the most popular book. In Christian book illumination we realize a similar development. The Books of Hours, the Psalters, the Breviaries, since they were copied for laymen, presented in fact a far larger field for the fancy of the miniaturist than the MSS. strictly for the service in the Church. In the present state of

investigation of the illumination of Hebrew MSS. it is premature to try to assign to the Haggadah a definite place. We may feel inclined to represent the Book devoted to the Passover Service as something very exceptional compared with other kinds of devotional writings. But putting aside the Bible Scrolls, which were never illuminated,⁸ we find that various Hebrew MSS., and among them also Bible Codices, have been ornamented and illustrated as well. The MSS. Add. 11639, Or. 54.b in the British Museum (examples of illustration in Margoliouth, *Hebrew and Samaritan MSS. in the British Museum*, III, pl. IX and X), written in 1278, of French provenience, is an encyclopedia not only with regard to its contents—it includes the Pentateuch, the Targum, rules for the Seder, the marriage ceremony, poetical pieces, and so on—but particularly as an illustrated book. It is true, however, that in Bibles of Spanish origin more reserve is to be noticed. In the incomparable Kennicott Old Testament (Boldeian, 2322), copied and illuminated in 1476 in La Corona by Joseph ibn Hayyim, there are only a few illustrations, the whole illumination being of a merely ornamental character.

The text of the Haggadah presents a continuous narrative, which is plain and clear, being thus adapted to the mind of the child. It is an educational book and that accounts for the character of its illustrations. The text of the Passover Service as constituted in the thirteenth century consists primarily of an exposition of some verses from the 5th book of the Torah, beginning with: "A wandering Aramean was my father, and he went down into Egypt, and sojourned there, few in number, and he became there a

⁸ Dr. M. Gaster, "Hebrew Illuminated MSS. of the Bible of the IXth and Xth century", in *Proceedings of the Society of Biblical Archaeology*, 1900, p. 226.

nation, great, mighty, and populous." There were added to these verses a reflection on the Paschal symbols by Rabban Gamaliel and several Psalms.⁹ The subject of the Haggadah is thus built up upon two fundamental facts of the ancient Jewish history: the migration of the Israelites into Egypt and the Exodus. The "stuff" of the narration had to be grouped round these chief events. The illustrator handled these events in their historical developments. For the sake of clearness he even enlarged the frontiers of the tale and particularly indulged in his naive descriptive way in the retrospective direction. In two Haggadahs of the British Museum, in Or. 2884 and Add. 27210, he simply begins *ab ovo*, with Adam and Eve. In the Haggadah of Sarajevo he does not hesitate to start with the beginning of the beginnings—the Creation of the World. In the Crawford Haggadah,¹⁰ and in another version of it, the Or. 1404 as well as in Or. 2737 of the British Museum, we are introduced *in medias res*, to the story of Moses and his divine mission. The three latter Haggadahs mark the transition towards a stronger systematizing of the subject treated and a more intimate adaptation to the Haggadah as such.

In the historical series of pictures beginning with the life of the first family there is a long way to pass till the Pass-over event. We notice there Noah enjoying the wine of his vineyard and being somewhat annoyed with the consequences of his too abundant libations; we watch the building of the fatal tower of Babel; we admire the peaceful idyllic scene of Abraham entertaining the angels, and of course we would not miss the sceptical smile of the incredulous Sarah. The wife of Lot was petrified, but Isaac

⁹ E. Baneth, *Der Sederabend*, Berlin 1904.

¹⁰ Now in the Ryland Library, Manchester.

has just escaped his horrible fate. He will afterwards have much trouble on account of his camouflaged son Jacob. And then there will be plenty of dreams, dreams of anxiety and dreams giving expression to the desire of fulfilment, Jacob beholding the ladder leading direct to heaven, Joseph with his ambitious visions, Pharaoh with his nightmares. Now we have reached at last the genuine soil of the Haggadah. Pharaoh will be a constant witness of the further rather turbulent events. He will have to be pleased with the ward of his eccentric daughter, the wonder child Moses, and he will have to engage in tedious pourparlers with those revolutionaries, the ungrateful foster-child and his verbose brother, Aaron. Pharaoh will make promises like a diplomat of the old school, and like him he will not keep them; pressure will be exercised and promises will again be given; new intrigues and plagues will follow, and, finally, Pharaoh will have to give way. The Jewish people are leaving Egypt; Miriam is dancing and singing with her companions. The Miriam picture, the scene of glory, completes the graphic narration.

In this rather schematical exposition the various versions of pictorial interpretation could not be considered, each one requiring a separate study. We have not mentioned in the series of pictures those devoted to the liturgy of Passover. In the treatment of these scenes there are to be found many divergencies in the various Haggadahs. The Sarajevo Haggadah, for instance, the oldest illustrated one known to us, shows only a few pictures of a liturgical character. There we have on Fol. 33¹¹ the distribution of Mazzoth treated in the same monumental style as the whole historical series, on Fol. 26¹² a text illustration rep-

¹¹ *Die Haggadah von Sarajevo*, pl. 33.

¹² *Ib.* p. 45.

resenting already the characteristic ornamented shield with the saying "This Mazzah", on Fol. 27¹² another text illustration with two figures carrying the bitter herbs, and on Fol. 31¹³ the Seder as an unconventional text illustration again.

In Or. 2723 we have after the Miriam picture 10 scenes dealing with the Seder and the preparation of the Service. They form a continuation of the historical scenes and are treated, like the latter, as full page miniatures. One of these liturgical scenes may be seen in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo", pl. V. In Add. 27210 the Miriam picture is grouped with three "preparation" scenes on one page, in Or. 2884 where the set of pictures shows striking similarity, from the iconographic point of view, with Add. 27210, there is only a slight divergency in the grouping of the pictures; thus the Miriam picture is on one page together with the Exodus (fol. 16b); the distribution of Mazzoth is as in Add. 27210 on the upper part and the cleaning of the house below (fol. 17a). There are, however, in Or. 2884 two more pictures: "The Synagogue" and the "Seder" (reproduced in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo", pl. VI). In Or. 1404 (and in the similar Crawford Haggadah) the liturgical scenes are grouped together on one page (fol. 17b), the upper part of the page includes a miniature representing the preparation of the lamb, and below there are two Seder scenes each with one couple¹⁴. Another Seder is represented on a border illumination (fol. 8). In the Haggadah Add. 14761 there are more liturgical scenes than in all the other Haggadahs, and there are no historical miniatures at all. We notice in the Spanish Haggadahs of the British Museum on the whole a develop-

¹² *Ib.* p. 3.

ment of the liturgical subjects in comparison with the earlier Haggadah of Sarajevo. This development does not, however, always mean the degeneration of the historical subjects; at any rate during the period of the 13th and 14th century there is no evidence of a supplanting of historical miniatures, and the absence of historical illustrations in Add. 14761 may be as well attributed to a loss of the set, the more so as in the similar Haggadah designated in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo" as the second of those belonging to the Library of Prof. Kaufmann, historical subjects are also treated.

The treatment of the liturgical scenes shows a great intimacy of the painter with the Passover rite and the customs of the Jews. In detailed pictures we see how the house is being cleaned, swept, and washed. We watch the subsequent manipulations of the baking of the Mazzoth and the roasting of the lamb on the high-roofed fire-place. The table is laid with a beautiful white cloth interwoven with blue arabesques, sometimes with hexagrams; the maid is carrying on her head a basket with the Paschal dishes; the family is seated round the table, the father in his armchair at the head of the table, the mother and the children on the longer side, facing the spectator, and a guest at the other end, opposite the father, seated like the host comfortably in an armchair. Everybody has his cup of wine, and the largest cup, a huge one in the middle of the table, is the cup for the prophet Elijah. In the Haggadah Add. 14761 in one of the Seder scenes (fol. 19b) every member of the family is resting his elbow on the table, a reminder of the ancient custom of eating in a recumbent position, a custom which the Jews observe to this day at the Seder. In Or. 2884 in the scene re-

produced in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo", pl. VI. 2, the child is putting questions to the father pointing with his left hand to a copy of the Haggadah on the table and raising his right hand as children usually do at school. The guest is also discussing some points with a member of the family. The mother is listening to the recital of her son. The room in which the Seder is performed is mostly vaulted and sometimes magnificently draped with curtains; in the Sarajevo Haggadah it is still plain, and the whole scene is treated in a free way, as a realistic picture taken directly from life. In the other Haggadahs, with the growing importance of the Liturgy, the desire is manifested to give an adequate expression of the dignity and solemnity of the Seder performance. The illuminator who worked at the Haggadah Add. 14761 achieved the most marvellous effects in his Seder scenes which represent the different stages of the Passover Service. One of these scenes (fol. 28 b.) he enclosed most beautifully in a framing consisting of variegated shafts, pomegranates, arabesques and heraldic devices; rosettes, buds, and acanthus leaves, lions, dogs, peacocks, and chimeric beasts, and musical instruments. At the top of the miniature there is a compartment reserved for the saying: "This is the bread of affliction", which saying has been interpreted in the picture below. On another folio enclosing the Seder scene (fol. 17b.) there are amoretti, butterflies, a hunting scene, and so on.

The liturgical part of the Haggadah is often completed by portraits of famous teachers, who have commented on, or developed during the ages, the Passover rite, men like R. Eliezer, R. Joshua, R. Eleazar ben Azariah, R. Akiba, and R. Tarfon. R. Akiba and Rabban Gamaliel are the most familiar heroes of the Haggadah illustration.

These portraits are generally treated as border illuminations. Many other liturgical pictures faithfully follow the text, so that in Add. 14671 almost every page includes an illustration, which either precedes the text as an upper border or covers the fore-edge or the lower margins. In addition there is frequently an illustration in a square framing interrupting the text somewhere in the middle of the page. This sort of composition we find also in the extremely fine miniatures of the "Second" Kaufmann Haggadah, which shows many other common features with Add. 14671 of the British Museum, a fact not noticed by the authors of "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo". Another fact ignored by them is the striking similarity, almost identity, of the Crawford Haggadah and the Or. 1404 of the British Museum, a fact already referred to in Mr. Margoliouth's Catalogue. The publication of H. Mueller, J. Schlosser, and D. Kaufmann is not exhaustive with regard to the Haggadahs of the British Museum. Mueller and Schlosser did not know them from personal observation, but were bound to form their opinion from a few photographs of these MSS. That may explain their error in assigning the Haggadah Or. 1404 to the first half of the 15th century¹⁴, whereas they date the Crawford Haggadah at the end of the 13th century¹⁵. In my opinion Or. 1404 is a more or less faithful copy of the Crawford Haggadah made rather early in the 14th century. The date of sale found in it (1402) speaks against Mueller and Schlosser's conjecture. The elaborate, dark shadowing of the faces, which we find sometimes also in Flemish paintings of the Renaissance, and the grey beards must have been added

¹⁴ The corresponding leaf of the Crawford Haggadah is reproduced in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo", plate II.

¹⁵ *Die Haggadah von Sarajevo*, pp. 95-111.

much later—that may account for the thickness of the paints in these particular places. On the whole the Crawford Haggadah and Or. 1404 belong to the early type of Haggadahs. A characteristic pointing to this is the meander and the folded tape motives in the framings of the miniatures, which generally begin to disappear at the end of 13th century¹⁶. We have them also in the MS. of the Mocatta Library including, besides Canticles, the book of Ruth etc., also "A lesson for the first day of Passover". This MS. is remarkable, for it shows motives of ornamentation which occur as early as in the 9th and 10th century in Hebrew Bibles, of which Dr. Gaster possesses some specimens, reproduced in his "Hebrew Illuminated Bibles of the IXth and Xth Century", 1900. These motives are small gilded rosettes and concentrical circles of bright coloring. They are a feature of Oriental illumination as well as the motive in the shape of a cucumber (*Gurkenmotiv*) which we also have in the elaborate interlacings formed with minuscular writings on the margins of the Mocatta MS. It is very likely that in the Mocatta MS. which has no illuminations we have even an earlier specimen than the Haggadah of Sarajevo.

Some anachronism may be found also in the Haggadah Or. 2737, where we see the wave motive with acanthus leaves treated in the plain geometrical way, a feature of Moorish ornamentation, and architectural façades with horse-shoe arches and colored tiles in bright yellows, reds, and greens. Similar architectural compositions executed in the same scheme of coloring are to be found in the

¹⁶ The type of the faces of the grotesques in the Haggadah text, which seem not to have been retouched, is very similar to that of the chimeric beasts in the "Lapidario", *op. cit.*, p. 68.

“Codice Albeldense o Vigilano” preserved in the Library of the Escorial (10th century¹⁷).

The full page illustrations are enclosed in Moorish arcatures, a motive which was repeated later in our ketubot, particularly in those of Oriental origin. In our Haggadah Or. 2723 which with regard to the Gothic character of the figures cannot be of earlier date than the 13th century (Schlosser assigns it even to the beginning of the 14th¹⁸) the architectural framing of the miniatures may be a copy of earlier specimens going back to the 10th century.

Now we have to deal with two Haggadahs which present some very interesting points. These are Or. 2884 and Add. 27210. Schlosser places the former in the 14th century and the latter at the beginning of the 14th¹⁹. I quite agree with him with regard to Add. 27210, and would like only to add some information on this Haggadah. It may be instructive to compare it with another Hebrew MS. of the British Museum, Add. 11639 (Or. 54 b) already mentioned, which has the advantage to be dated (it includes a calendar opening with the year 1278). The style of the miniature is the same—it is the style of French Gothic—with the only difference that in Add. 27210 the architecture is a little more advanced, and that the figures have that exaggerated bending attitude which is a characteristic of later Gothic. The treatment of the faces which are only drawn with a pen with a bit of pink on the cheeks is very much the same in both MSS. It should be mentioned in addition that in Add. 11639, fol. 333 b, there is an escutcheon with an eagle in gold on a blue background;¹⁹

¹⁷ Reproduced in *Museo Espagnol de Antiguedades*, vol. III, opp. p. 509.

¹⁸ *Die Haggadah von Sarajevo*, pp. 95-111.

¹⁹ Another eagle of the same design but on a red background is to be found on fol. 347 b, reproduced in Margoliouth, *Hebrew and Samaritan MSS. in the British Museum*, vol. III.

the same may be distinguished on the shields of the Egyptians in Add. 27210, fol. 14 b.

There is no doubt that the miniatures in the Haggadah Add. 27210 are of the French Gothic style, and it is only surprising to notice that the illustrations in the Haggadah Or. 2884, though they are very similar to them from the iconographic point of view, that is with regard to the handling of the subjects, are quite different with regard to style. There we have that admixture of Moorish and Gothic features which points rather to Spain, but at any rate not to France. The difference of technique and style is so considerable that we cannot speak of direct influence; there is nevertheless an incontestable relationship between the two MSS.; they may have been derived from the same source, but had undergone very different influences; one became a rather conventional but technically irreproachable French "Bible historiée", the other a more provincial, spontaneous and personal, technically inferior, but invaluable attempt at Jewish illustration.

The dating of the Haggadah Add. 14761 we have reserved to the end; it is chronologically perhaps the latest of our Haggadahs. We have alluded above in connection with the contents of its illumination to the advance of historical pictures and the lavishness of decoration. Schlosser is right in adding a question mark to his rather doubtful date. He speaks of the beginning of the 14th century²⁰. Very fortunately we have in the Bodleian Library a Commentary of Rashi on the Pentateuch, written by Meir ben Samuel in 1396²¹. This MS., executed in square Spanish writing, exhibits much affinity with our Haggadah Add. 14761 with regard to its decoration. There

²⁰ *Die Haggadah von Sarajevo*, pp. 95–111.

²¹ 187. Can. Or. 81.

we have the same peculiar ornament of scrolls and heavy broad leaves, gold dots, acorns or buds, the graceful flamings, griffins, with their fine long legs. Even the small square framings with semi-circular segments on the sides occur in both MSS. On page 96 of the dated MS. there is to be found a composition which recalls the marvellous leaves of the Haggadah Add. 14761 with their gorgeous ornamentation. In both MSS. the marginal decoration takes an unusual width. There is only one Haggadah which, as mentioned above, shows similarity with Add. 14761, that is the "Second" Kaufmann Haggadah. Now we may group the dated MS. of the Bodleian Library (of 1396), the Haggadah of the British Museum, Add. 14761, and Kaufmann's Haggadah together. In the "Second" Kaufmann Haggadah we have (reproduced on pl. XXXIII and XXXIV in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo") the same scrolls with trifolium leaves, some round, others pointed, and the broad, heavy leaves as on fol. 51 in Add. 14761. Great similarity is shown in fol. 71, in Kaufmann's Haggadah (pl. XXXIV in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo") with fol. 64 b in Add. 14761. In both we see a man sitting and raising his arm with a cup of wine. The same initial word is on the head of the miniature. In Kaufmann's specimen there are two other figures in addition, small boys, which are missing in Add. 14761. In the Exodus scene in Add. 14761, fol. 66 b, Moses wears a high hat with a long feather; this is also his head dress in the scene of the Exodus in the Kaufmann Haggadah (pl. XXXV in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo"). Another illumination of the Kaufmann Haggadah—an arabesque in the middle of the folio and four figures in the corners blowing long trumpets (pl. XXXIII in "Die Hag-

gadah von Sarajevo")—shows a certain similarity with the miniature on fol. 61 in Add. 14761 (pl. V. 1 in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo"). We recognize also in both Haggadahs the dark-faced warriors riding on cocks (in Add. 14761 one of them is riding on a lion). The description of fol. 78 of the Kaufmann Haggadah, as given on p. 197 in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo", corresponds perfectly also to the Seder picture on fol. 19 b in Add. 14761. There is even the same initial word in both pictures.

There are on the whole many common features of composition, design, and initial illumination in these MSS. A striking characteristic of both Haggadahs is, in spite of the Gothic architecture, the scarcity of Gothic ornamentation. The broad, heavy leaves have nothing in common with pointed, sharp, hard leaves used in Gothic decoration. Those gorgeous smooth leaves begin to appear in the 14th century in Italy and later on in other countries as well. The influence of French Gothic never was very strong in Italian ornamentation, nor was it ever very accentuated in Spain, where Moorish and Italian elements counteracted French ideas of decoration. Italian influences may have obtained a stronger hold in Spain since the Spanish dynasty was connected with Naples and Sicily (James II, 1327–36, succeeded to Sicily; Alphons V, 1416–58, was king of Naples and Sicily; Ferdinand II, 1474–1516, united the Spanish crown with Naples and Sicily). It should not be a matter of surprise to see the Italian decoration appear in Spain beginning with the middle of the 14th century. There is one feature in the Haggadah Add. 14761 which points at least to 1340²²—the party-colored dresses of the merry musicians on the marvellous apotheosis of Maz-

²² J. Robinson Planche, *A Cyclopaedia of Costume*, 1879, II, p. 85.

zoth (fol. 61, reproduced on pl. V. 1. in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo"). In the Kaufmann Haggadah the costumes also betray the trecento, the sleeves have become wider, the dresses more ample. The faces and figures, though of the same type as those in Add. 14761, in the Sarajevo Haggadah, and in the "Second" Kaufmann Haggadah, are more expressive, the movements less conventional, the nude is of a better design (compare the maids of the Daughter of Pharaoh as represented in the different Haggadahs). There is to be noticed also, for the first time in our study, an attempt at perspective drawing in Kaufmann's Haggadah. Besides the armchairs with little scrolls, which are a familiar feature of all the three Haggadahs, there occurs a chair designed not as usual en face or en profile, but already with an attempt at foreshortening, en trois quarts (pl. XXXIV in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo").

Is there any direct relationship to be seen between the Kaufmann Haggadah and that of the British Museum? Besides the many features of similarity, there are some which are even perfectly identical, as, for example, the ornamentation in the framing of the pictures. It is of course impossible to say anything on the coloring of the illumination of the Kaufmann Haggadah without seeing the original, but the few words of M. Mueller on the "coloristic gift" of the illuminator, on "the variety of shades, held together with the deep purple of the backgrounds",²³ suggest precisely the color scheme of the Haggadah of the British Museum—of our Add. 14761, and also of the Bodleian MS. of 1396.

M. Mueller thinks that that "Second" Kaufmann Haggadah was illuminated in Italy, perhaps in Genoa,

²³ *Die Haggadah von Sarajevo*, p. 188.

on the frontier of French and Italian influences. He points to the *Messale detto dell' incoronazione di G. Galeazzo Visconti*, illuminated in 1395²⁴, which, although it exhibits many common features of style (particularly the broad, heavy leaves of the ornamentation), shows no closer affinity with the Kaufmann Haggadah. It should also be noticed that the Kaufmann Hagadah is written in square Spanish characters, identical with those of Add. 14761. In addition we have in the Kaufmann Haggadah (fol. 66, reproduced on pl. XXXIII in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo") the escutcheon of a red castle on a gold background and (on fol. 84.) the Aragonian red and gold stripes. The castle belongs, however, to the heraldic bearings of Castile. Castile and Aragon were united in 1479, but the heraldic devices of both kingdoms often occur simultaneously in the same books at an earlier date, for instance, in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria de D. Alfonso el Sabio*²⁵, in the illustrations of which MS. the king of united Castile and Leon appears with "castles and lions" on his escutcheons and the king of Aragon with his red and gold stripes. Shields with vertical stripes occur also in the Haggadah Add. 14761, although they are in gold and blue. The Haggadah of Sarajevo also contains the Aragonian stripes and in addition a wing (red on gold), which I was fortunate enough to find (there in gold on red, with a hand carrying a sword) on the heraldic bearings of Enrique II of Castile and Leon, in the 14th century.²⁶ The gold wing may have been used in Spanish heraldry earlier of course. There is another heraldic sign which is a constant feature

²⁴ Reproduced in Luca Beltrami, *L'arte negli arredi sacri della Lombardia*, Milano, 1897, pl. VIII.

²⁵ *Las public. la R. Academia Espanola*, Madrid, 1885, p. 8.

²⁶ *Museo Espanol de Antiguedades*, Don Jose Maria Escudero de la Pena, "Signos Rodados de los Reyes de Castilla", vol. VI. p. 247.

in Jewish illumination—the fleur-de-lys. The French lilies occur very early in Spain and in other countries, so that their presence in a MS. does not help very much to fix its origin. The sponsor of Enrique II, Dona Juana Manuel, is represented on a round seal with a fleur-de-lys in her right hand. Don Jose Fernandez Montana²⁷ points in addition to the great importance of the family Lison in Spain (which carried, as the name suggests, the lilies in their escutcheons) since 1380.

R. Todros ha-Levi, a Jew from Toledo, carried a fleur-de-lys on his seal in the 14th century (now in the British Museum). The Moorish crescent and the star are also a feature of Hebrew illumination; we find them already in the Mocatta MS. combined there with the hexagram, or the two superimposed triangles²⁸. The hexagram is met with in ancient times on Jewish tombs and Synagogues²⁹. We find it also in Mohammedan sepulchral art, as, for instance, on the Tomb of the Great Mahmud (A. D. 997–1030) in the plain of Ghazni. In the Middle Ages the hexagram is already a feature of Moorish ornamentation and is found also in Christian art. In the famous Arundel Psalter of 1380 it is used as a filling-in for two initials in white on blue background. It appears there also once combined with the fleur-de-lys. In our Haggadahs the hexagram—or should we call it the Magen David?—is very often represented. It is interwoven in the table cloth in the Haggadah Add. 14761, we have it in the Mocatta MS., and in the Haggadah Add. 27210 there is a hexagram in

²⁷ "Codice Hebreo de la Biblia en el Monasterio del Escorial" in *Museo Espanol de Antiguedades*, vol. VIII, p. 85.

²⁸ *Catalogue of the Anglo-Jewish Historical Exhibition*, 1887, compiled by J. Jacobs and Lucien Wolf, London, 1888, ill. opp. p. 138.

²⁹ Dr. Alfred Grotte, "Die Bedeutung der Galiläischen Synagogenausgrabungen fuer die Wissenschaft", in *Monatsschrift fuer Geschichte und Wissenschaft des Judentums*, 1921, LXV, pp. 16–31.

gold with blue green fillings. The motive of the hexagram has been used for many elaborate patterns, sometimes it was combined with scrolls, or inscribed in a circle and in a square or encircled with segments of a circle etc. Arabesques of various other designs generally occur on the same pages in the Haggadáhs with the hexagrams, so that it is difficult to say whether the illuminator assigned to the hexagram a particular meaning. The arabesque of superimposed squares appears, for example, mostly as a pattern on the *Mazzoth* in the scene of the preparation of the *Mazzoth* and in the *Seder* scene. It seems that, owing to this custom of embellishing the *Mazzoth* with geometrical patterns, the arabesque had an emotional significance, and that explains why the saying "This *Mazzah* . . ." in the *Haggadah* is very often interpreted with a beautiful arabesque of intricate design and bright coloring, glowing with scarlet, gold, green, and blue.

The hexagram was an occult sign, occurring in writings on magic, in the Cabala, and even in modern times in theosophic literature. The hexagram belonged to the common symbolic language. It may be that the Portuguese Jews played a particular rôle in the spreading of it, and in the first place among their brethren all over Europe. Through the Spanish emigrés the hexagram may have been introduced to the Jews of Eastern Europe; so we find a hexagram on a Jewish seal in Shavorka, a Ukrainian township, in 1544 (the Moorish crescent and the star on the seal of a Jew in Medjibodj in Podolia from 1543 must have similarly made its way from Spain), then in 1627 on a Jewish seal in Prague and in Kremsier (Moravia). The hexagram, after having been an individual mark, became the sign of the whole community. Later on we see it in

Dresden, Kriegshaber, Beuthen, and so on³⁰. Another pattern of Oriental origin we meet with in the Spanish Haggadahs is a shield, sometimes in the shape of the cucumber (Persian motive) filled with flourishes, which later on acquire a Gothic outline. The regular appearance of this motive should be mentioned as it may have had some significance, and it points in any case to Oriental influences which very strongly affected Hebrew illumination in the Middle Ages.

The more we examine blazons, geographical maps, astrological writings, and other secular MSS. in Spain, the more we feel convinced that there has been a close relation between these productions and the Jewish illuminated MSS.¹ Most of the features we have examined are to be found in those documents too. We have there stars in the shapes of the hexagram in the "Lapidario", the book on precious stones compiled with the help of Jewish scholars, we have the fleur-de-lys, the heraldic lion, stars and stripes, the crescent and the hexagram on the famous map, compiled by Judah Cresques, the Jew. The crescent and also the hexagram are drawn there on the flags of Turkish provinces. The Catalan map gives plenty of motives for the Haggadah; there are camels, goats, even the dapple-gray horses of the Haggadah Add. 14761 are to be found there and the bundle of rods in the hand of the camel driver on the map looks exactly like the bundle of rods with which the Egyptian task-master is striking Hebrew slaves in the Haggadah.

Christian iconography has of course also exercised a considerable influence on the Haggadah illumination. The wife of Moses going with the children to join her father

³⁰ See in the Jewish Encyclopedia, in Russian, "Seals" vol. XII, reproduced on columns 489-492.

looks very much like Mary on her flight into Egypt, Miriam and her dancing companions remind us of the virgins of the Zodiac in Christian MSS., the architectural framing of the Seder scenes is composed quite similarly to the arcatures enclosing the scene of the last Supper. But these are only superficial features of similarity; there is no real affinity between the Haggadahs and Christian religious illumination. The Jewish family participating in the Passover service is very strongly characterized in the attitude of the performers of the rite—the father, the child, and the guest; and also in the attributes of the performance: the copies of the Haggadah on the table, the cushion on which the father is resting, etc. It may happen to the thoughtless illuminator that in copying a divine figure from a model book, he reproduces also the halo round its head, but these are rare exceptions (once in the Haggadah Add. 27210 where the miniatures exhibit a very strong French influence, and in Kaufmann's "Second" Hagadah, pl. 103, mentioned in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo", p. 198).

The Hebrew writing of the Spanish MSS. of the 13th and 14th century is exceedingly plain, bold, and legible. All the Haggadahs we have examined are written in those square "Spanish" characters⁸¹. The lettering is executed in black ink, the initial words are generally of burnished gold or silver, outlined with red ink. The writing is of a considerable size and rather massive in execution. We can easily distinguish it from the Hebrew Franco-German handwriting, which is of a more flexible articulation and undulating outline. The Hispano-Hebrew writing being more

⁸¹ I am very much indebted to Dr. H. Hirschfeld of the Jews' College (London) who kindly helped me in verifying the calligraphic features of the writing of the Haggadahs in question.

rude shows more character and strength. It is particularly well adapted to the rather heavy and rich ornamentation, which never attempts to achieve the slender elegance of Northern Gothic.

The Hebrew alphabet ignores in general the capitals—we know only of a few instances of initial ornamentation as used in Christian illumination. Generally we have to understand by initial illumination in Hebrew MSS. the illumination of whole words and sayings. This custom of illuminating had been preserved later on in printed books and, as it would have been extravagant to make woodcuts of whole sayings and headings for every occasion, the Jews used to put together ornamented single initials so that the effect was very similar to that of hand-written initial words³². Characteristic specimens of the illumination of initial words may be found in "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo", plate IV. 2 (reproduced from the Haggadah Add. 27210) and in G. Margoliouth, *Catalogue of the Hebrew and Samaritan MSS. in the British Museum*, 1905, vol. II, plate VIII (reproduced from Add. 19,944.). The former is an example of medieval illumination, in the latter the framing of the initial word has already taken on the less intricate form announcing the transition to the Renaissance. Good examples of this later period are to be found in Mahzor No. 736 of the 15th century, belonging to the collection of Dr. M. Gaster, in London.

The initial illumination of our Haggadahs consists in putting the words executed in gold, silver or bright colors on a diapered background and in ornamented framings. The technique is gouache painting, generally very thick and viscid with profuse gilding. On the whole the color-

³² Printed Haggadah, Prague, 1526, reproduced in the *Jewish Encyclopedia*, vol X, p. 166.

ing of our Haggadahs is very bright. There is a great variety of colors, a brilliant cinnabar, a deep purple yellow, bright and dull greens, various shades of brown and grey, and black. The blues are not as predominant as they are in French illumination. The authors of "Die Haggadah von Sarajevo" attribute the coloring to Spanish influences, but it is interesting to note that in Spanish MSS. of the 13th and 14th century the coloring does not differ so very much from that of the French MSS., whereas in older paintings in Spain, for example in frescoes and in the illumination of the 10th century, we have that particular, shall we say, Oriental color scheme, with a profusion of reds and yellows and not much of dark blue. It may be that the Jewish illuminators in their conservatism preserved till later times a predilection for this particular color scheme. The characteristic coloring is a strong feature of Hebrew illumination in Spain, and helps as much as the calligraphy to ascertain the provenience of the MSS.

Not one of our Haggadahs is dated or signed. Most of them are very much worn and it is no matter of surprise that the colophons are missing. We possess fortunately a great number of contemporary MSS. which are dated by the Jewish copyists, who sometimes do not omit to mention that they also illuminated the MSS. There we have Joshua b. Abraham Ibn Gaon who states in his Bible codex (2323 Bodleian) that he copied and illuminated the MS. in 1306(?) at Soria (in old Castile), having learned his craft from his tutor Isaac, son of Gershom, for "the venerable and beloved" Moses Ibn Habib. Joseph Ibn Hayyim represents himself as the creator of the unparalleled illumination of the Bible codex, executed in 1476 at La Corona (2322, Bodleian). Abraham b. Judah Ibn Hayyim

wrote in 1252 a "Treatise on the preparation of colors and gold for illuminating books".³³ This treatise has been preserved in the Codex de Rossi, 945, in Parma. There are to be found special hints as to Hebrew lettering. This man certainly was an artist himself, human activities in those days being not yet as differentiated as they are now. He was an artist and an author like the learned Ḥayyim b. Israel of Toledo, who, in 1377, copied the Bible Codex, preserved in the Derossiana in Parma, and beautifully illustrated it³⁴. The technical terms of illumination passed very early into the Hebrew language. Thus Rashi (11th century) used the technical term "auripigmentum" for the medium with which the painters used to mix their colors to fix them to the vellum³⁵.

³³ *Die Haggadah von Sarajevo*, p. 299

³⁴ *Ib.*, p. 260.

³⁵ Rashi spells אֲוּרִיפִיגְמֵנְט, in Romanesque "orpiment", comp. Moïse Schwab, "Une Haggadah illustrée," *Revue des Etudes Juives*, vol. 45, p. 114.